## IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS DALLAS DIVISION

THE HONORABLE BARBARA J. HOUSER (RET.), IN HER CAPACITY AS TRUSTEE OF THE BSA SETTLEMENT TRUST,

Plaintiff,

v.

Civ. Action No. 3:23-cv-01592-S

ALLIANZ GLOBAL RISKS US INSURANCE COMPANY; ALLIED WORLD ASSURANCE COMPANY, LTD, et al.

Defendants.

#### UNDERSIGNED DEFENDANTS' MOTION TO DISMISS THE COMPLAINT

The undersigned defendants ("Undersigned Defendants") respectfully submit this motion to dismiss the Complaint pursuant to Federal Rules of Civil Procedure 12(b)(1), 12(b)(2) and 12(b)(6), and on the basis of *Colorado River* abstention, and represent as follows:

#### I. MOTION TO DISMISS

For the reason outlined in the accompanying memorandum, the Court should dismiss under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 12(b)(1) all of the Trustee's causes of action regarding coverage for unprocessed Abuse Claims because they are unripe. In the alternative, the Court should dismiss under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 12(b)(6) all of the Trustee's causes of action regarding coverage for Abuse Claims, because the Complaint fails to adequately plead any cause of action upon which relief can be granted. If not mooted by the foregoing requested relief, the Court should dismiss under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 12(b)(2) the Trustee's causes of action against the non-resident PJ Moving Defendants (as defined in the accompanying memorandum) to the extent

PageID 3838

they seek damages or coverage arising out of policies that were issued to entities located outside of Texas, as the Court lacks personal jurisdiction over such claims. The Court should also dismiss the Trustee's causes of action regarding a subset of Abuse Claims that are already subject to litigation in Illinois state court under the doctrine of *Colorado River* abstention.

#### II. ARGUMENTS AND AUTHORITIES

In accordance with Local Rule 7.1(d), Undersigned Defendants submit in support of this Motion to Dismiss a memorandum setting forth their contentions of law, and their arguments and authorities supporting dismissal, which are incorporated herein.

WHEREFORE, PREMISES CONSIDERED, Undersigned Defendants pray that this Court grant its Motion to Dismiss the Complaint pursuant to Federal Rules of Civil Procedure 12(b)(1), 12(b)(2) and 12(b)(6), and on the basis of *Colorado River* abstention.

Dated: October 6, 2023 Respectfully submitted,

Christopher J. St. Jeanos (*pro hac vice*) New York Bar No. 2805729

Ciara A. Sisco (*pro hac vice*) New York Bar No. 5583471

WILLKIE FARR & GALLAGHER LLP

787 Seventh Avenue

New York, New York 10019

(212) 728-8000 (212) 728-8111 (fax) CStjeanos@willkie.com CSisco@willkie.com

Joseph G. Davis (pro hac vice)

D.C. Bar No. 441479 Zainab A. Ali (*pro hac vice*) D.C. Bar No. 90014285

WILLKIE FARR & GALLAGHER LLP

1875 K Street NW Washington, DC 20006 /s/Betty X. Yang
Betty X. Yang

Texas Bar No. 24088690 Michael A. Rosenthal Texas Bar No. 17281490

GIBSON, DUNN & CRUTCHER LLP

2001 Ross Avenue Suite 2100

Dallas, Texas 75201 (214) 698-3100 (214) 571-2900 (fax) BYang@gibsondunn.com MRosenthal@gibsondunn.com

James Hallowell (*pro hac vice*) New York Bar No. 2688869 Amanda A. George (*pro hac vice*) New York Bar No. 5645817

GIBSON, DUNN & CRUTCHER LLP

200 Park Avenue New York, NY 10166 (202) 303-1000 (202) 303-2000 (fax) JDavis@willkie.com ZAli@willkie.com

(212) 351-4000 (212) 351 4035 (fax) JHallowell@gibsondunn.com

AGeorge@gibsondunn.com

Company, The Insurance Company of the St

mpany, National Union Fire Insurance Comp

Counsel for American Home Assurance Company, The Insurance Company of the State of Pennsylvania, Lexington Insurance Company, National Union Fire Insurance Company of Pittsburgh, Pa., New Hampshire Insurance Company, and Consolidated National Insurance Company

#### /s/ Richard D. Salgado

Richard D. Salgado Texas Bar No. 24060548

MCDERMOTT WILL & EMERY LLP 2501 North Harwood Street, Suite 1900

Dallas, TX 75201

Telephone: 214.210.2797 Facsimile: 972.232.3098

Email: richard.salgado@mwe.com

Ryan S. Smethurst (pro hac vice)

D.C. Bar No. 469824

Alex M. Spisak (pro hac vice)

D.C. Bar No. 1028451

MCDERMOTT WILL & EMERY LLP

The McDermott Building 500 North Capitol Street, NW Washington, DC 20001-1531 Telephone: 202.756.8228 Facsimile: 202.756.8087

Email: rsmethurst@mwe.com Email: aspisak@mwe.com

#### /s/ Thomas B. Alleman

Thomas B. Alleman
Texas Bar No. 01017485
DYKEMA GOSSETT PLLC
1717 Main, Suite 4200

Dallas, Texas 75201 Phone: 214-698-7830 talleman@dykema.com

Counsel for Allied World Assurance Company (U.S.) Inc.

# Counsel for Jefferson Insurance Company

#### /s/ Christina A. Culver

Brian S. Martin

Texas Bar No. 13055350 bmartin@thompsoncoe.com

Christina A. Culver Texas Bar No. 24078388 cculver@thompsoncoe.com

THOMPSON, COE, COUSINS & IRONS,

L.L.P.

One Riverway, Suite 1400

#### /s/ David J. Schubert

David Schubert

Texas Bar No. 17820800

E-Mail: dschubert@schubertevans.com

Blake S. Evans

Texas Bar No. 06706950

E-Mail: bevans@schubertevans.com

Stephen Burnett

Texas Bar No. 24006931

E-Mail: sburnett@schubertevans.com

Houston, Texas 77056-1988 (713) 403-8210 Telephone (713) 403-8299 Facsimile

Counsel for Allstate Insurance Company

SCHUBERT & EVANS 900 Jackson, Suite 630 Dallas, Texas 75202 Telephone: (214) 744-4400

Facsimile: (214) 744-4403

Ronald P. Schiller (*pro hac vice*) Pennsylvania Bar No. 41357

Matthew A. Hamermesh (pro hac vice)

Pennsylvania Bar No. 82313 Elizabeth C. Dolce (*pro hac vice*) Pennsylvania Bar No. 324448

HANGLEY ARONCHICK SEGAL PUDLIN &

**SCHILLER** 

One Logan Square 27th Floor Philadelphia, PA 19103 Telephone: (215) 468-6200 Facsimile: (215) 468-0300 rschiller@hangley.com mhamermesh@hangley.com edolce@hangley.com

/s/ Michael T. Cooke

Texas Bar No. 04759650

Fort Worth, Texas 76102

Michael T. Cooke

mtc@fsclaw.com

Counsel for Arch Insurance Company

FRIEDMAN SUDER & COOKE

604 East 4th Street, Suite 200

/s/ Stephen A. Melendi
Stephen A. Melendi
Texas Bar No. 24041468
stephenm@tbmmlaw.com
Matt Rigney
Texas Bar No. 24068636
mattr@tbmmlaw.com
TOLLEFSON BRADLEY MITCHELL &
MELENDI, LLP
2811 McKinney Avenue, Suite 250 West
Dallas, Texas 75204

Counsel for Arrowood Indemnity Company

Kathleen Kerns (*pro hac vice*) kkerns@postschell.com POST & SCHELL, P.C. 1600 John F. Kennedy Blvd. 13<sup>th</sup> Floor Philadelphia, PA 19103

Counsel for Argonaut Insurance Company and Colony Insurance Company

### /s/ David Clay Wilkerson

David Clay Wilkerson BROWN SIMS, P.C. Texas Bar No. 24010480 cwilkerson@brownsims.com 1990 Post Oak Blvd., **Suite 1800** Houston, Texas 77056 713.629.1580 713.629.5027 (facsimile)

Counsel for Aspen Specialty Insurance Company

#### /s/ S. Jan Hueber

S. Jan Hueber Texas Bar No. 20331150 hueber@litchfieldcavo.com LITCHFIELD CAVO, LLP 100 Throckmorton Street, Ste. 500 Fort Worth, Texas 76102 Telephone: 817.945.8025 Facsimile: 817.753.3232

Daniel G. Litchfield (pro hac vice) IL Bar No. 6185695 litchfield@litchfieldcavo.com LITCHFIELD CAVO, LLP 303 W. Madison Street, Suite 300 Chicago, IL 60606 Telephone: 312.781.6660

Counsel for The Cincinnati Insurance Company

/s/ Charles R. "Skip" Watson Charles R. "Skip" Watson Texas Bar No. 20967500 watsons@gtlaw.com Nicole Leonard Cordoba Texas Bar No. 24106197

cordoban@gtlaw.com

### /s/ Aaron L. Mitchell

Aaron L. Mitchell Texas Bar No. 14205590 TOLLEFSON BRADLEY MITCHELL & MELENDI, LLP 2811 McKinney Ave., Suite 250 Dallas, Texas 75204 Direct: (214) 665-0110 Fax: (214) 665-0199 aaronm@tbmmlaw.com

Counsel for Ategrity Specialty Insurance Company

# /s/ Pamela Dunlop Gates Pamela Dunlop Gates

Texas Bar No. 06239800 CORPORATE LITIGATION CNA Apex at Legacy 5801 Headquarters Drive, Suite 750A Plano, Texas 75024-6189 (214) 220-5921 - Direct Dial pamela.dunlopgates@cna.com

Laura McNally, Esq. (pro hac vice) Illinois Bar No. 6226965 LOEB & LOEB LLP 321 N. Clark Street, Suite 2300 Chicago, IL 60654 312-464-3155

Counsel for American Casualty Company of Reading, Pennsylvania, CNA Financial Corporation, Columbia Casualty Company, Continental Casualty Company, The Continental Insurance Company, National Fire Insurance Company of Hartford

#### /s/ Scott L. Davis

Scott L. Davis Texas Bar No. 055437030 HUSCH BLACKWELL LLP 1900 N. Pearl Street, Suite 1800 Dallas, Texas 75201

Phone: (214) 999-6100

Joseph W. Shaneyfelt Texas Bar No. 24105406 joe.shaneyfelt@gtlaw.com GREENBERG TRAURIG LLP 300 West 6th Street, Suite 2050 Austin, Texas 78701 T: (512) 320-7200 F: (512) 320-7210

Counsel for Columbia Insurance Company

#### /s/ David M. Hymer

David M. Hymer Texas Bar No. 10380250 david.hymer@qpwblaw.com Steven Wood Texas Bar No. 24033355 Steven.wood@qpwblaw.com QUINTAIROS, PRIETO, WOOD & BOYER, PA. 1700 Pacific Avenue, Suite 4545 Dallas, Texas 75201 (214) 754-8755 (214) 754-8744 (Fax)

Counsel for Erie Family Life Insurance Company and Erie Insurance Exchange

### /s/ Jeremy T. Brown

Jeremy T. Brown Texas Bar No. 24055221 jbrown@keatingbrown.com **KEATING BROWN PLLC** 18383 Preston Road, Ste. 300

Dallas, Texas 75252

Telephone: (214) 390-7701

Fax: (214) 999-6170

Scott.Davis@huschblackwell.com

Tyler Scott (pro hac vice) Missouri Bar No. 63231 HUSCH BLACKWELL LLP 4801 Main Street, Suite 1000 Kansas City, MO 64112 Phone: (816) 983-8274

Fax: (816) 983-8080

Tyler.Scott@huschblackwell.com

Counsel for Crum & Forster Indemnity Company, TIG Insurance Company, The North River Insurance Company, and United States Fire Insurance Company

/s/ Roy A. Mura Roy A. Mura, Esq. (pro hac vice) New York Bar No. 2112035 MURA LAW GROUP, PLLC 14 Lafayette Square, Suite 930 Buffalo, New York 14203 (716) 855-2800 roy.mura@muralaw.com

Kieran W. Leary, Esq. Texas Bar No. 24108517 TOLLEFSON BRADLEY MITCHELL & MELENDI, LLP 2811 McKinney Avenue, Suite 250 Dallas, Texas 75204 (214) 665-0119 kieranl@tbmmlaw.com

Counsel for Erie and Niagara Insurance Association

### /s/ Ivan M. Rodriguez

Ivan M. Rodriguez Texas Bar No. 24058977 Clinton J. Wolbert Texas Bar No. 24103020 Katherine B. Wilson Texas Bar No. 24096034 PHELPS DUNBAR, L.L.P. Counsel for Everest National Insurance Company

910 Louisiana Street, Suite 4300 Houston, Texas 77002 Telephone: (713) 877-5504 Facsimile: (713) 626-1388

E-mail: ivan.rodriguez@phelps.com E-mail: clinton.wolbert@phelps.com E-mail: katherine.wilson@phelps.com

William R. de los Santos Texas Bar No. 24125762 PHELPS DUNBAR, L.L.P. 2102 E. State Highway 114, Suite 207 Southlake, Texas 76092 Telephone: (817) 488-3134

E-mail: william.delossantos@phelps.com

Counsel for Evanston Insurance Company

/s/ Stephen A. Melendi

Stephen A. Melendi Texas Bar No. 24041468 stephenm@tbmmlaw.com

Frank Kennedy

Texas Bar No. 00787820 frankk@tbmmlaw.com

TOLLEFSON BRADLEY MITCHELL &

MELENDI, LLP

2811 McKinney Avenue, Suite 250 West

Dallas, Texas 75204 Telephone: 214-665-0100 Facsimile: 214-665-0199

Counsel for First Insurance Company of

Hawaii. LTD

/s/ Shannon M. O'Malley

Shannon M. O'Malley Texas Bar No. 24037200 somalley@zellelaw.com

Megan E. Zeller

Texas Bar No. 24082187 mzeller@zellelaw.com

ZELLE LLP

901 Main Street, Suite 4000 Dallas, TX 75202-3975

Telephone: 214-742-3000 Facsimile: 214-760-8994

Gary P. Seligman (pro hac vice)

D.C. Bar No. 468046

Ashley L. Criss (pro hac vice)

D.C. Bar No. 1048326 Wiley Rein LLP 2050 M Street NW

Washington, DC 20036 Phone: (202) 719-7000 Fax: (202) 719-7049

E-mail: gseligman@wiley.law,

acriss@wiley.law

Counsel for General Star Indemnity Company

/s/ Aaron L. Mitchell

Aaron L. Mitchell

Texas Bar No. 14205590

Beth Bradley

Texas Bar No. 06243900

TOLLEFSON BRADLEY MITCHELL &

MELENDI, LLP

2811 McKinney Ave., Suite 250

Dallas, Texas 75204 Direct: (214) 665-0110 Fax: (214) 665-0199 aaronm@tbmmlaw.com bethb@tbmmlaw.com

Lloyd A. Gura (pro hac vice)

NY Bar - 2380277

Pamela J. Minetto (pro hac vice)

NY Bar - 2241685

One New York Plaza 44th Floor

New York, NY 10004 Tel: (212) 804-4282 Fax: (973) 242-4244 lgura@moundcotton.com pminetto@moundcotton.com

Counsel for Indian Harbor Insurance Company, on behalf of itself and as successor in interest to Catlin Specialty Insurance Company /s/ Aaron Z. Tobin

Aaron Z. Tobin

Texas Bar No. 24028045 William G. Whitehill Texas Bar No. 21356550

Justin D. Hanna

Texas Bar No. 24095726

CONDON TOBIN SLADEK THORNTON

NERENBERG PLLC 8080 Park Lane, Ste. 700 Dallas, Texas 75231 Telephone: 214.691.6300 Facsimile: 214.691.6311 atobin@condontobin.com bwhitehill@condontobin.com

jhanna@condontobin.com

Kim V. Marrkand

Massachusetts Bar No. 543823

MINTZ, LEVIN, COHN, FERRIS, GLOVSKY

AND POPEO PC One Financial Center Boston, MA 02111

Telephone: (617) 542-6000 kvmarrkand@mintz.com

Douglas R. Gooding

Massachusetts Bar No. 558976

Bryana T. McGillycuddy

Massachusetts Bar No. 684990

CHOATE, HALL & STEWART LLP

Two International Place Boston, MA 02110

Telephone: (617) 248-5000

dgooding@choate.com

bmcgillycuddy@gmail.com

Counsel for Liberty Insurance Underwriters Inc., Liberty Mutual Insurance Company, Liberty Surplus Insurance Corporation, The Ohio Casualty Insurance Company, Peerless Indemnity Insurance Company, Safeco Insurance Company of America & Wausau General Insurance Company

# /s/ Gary S. Kessler

Gary S. Kessler Texas Bar No. 11358200 Anne-Alise "Ali" Hinckley Texas Bar No. 24090786 ahinckley@kesslercollins.com Samuel C. Kessler Texas Bar No. 24118431 skessler@kesslercollins.com KESSLER COLLINS 500 N. Akard St., Ste. 3700 Dallas, TX 75201 214.379.0722 Telephone 214.373.4714 Facsimile

Thaddeus J. Weaver (pro hac vice) Delaware Bar Id. No. 2790 tweaver@dilworthlaw.com DILWORTH PAXSON LLP 704 N. King Street, Suite 500 P.O. Box 1031 Wilmington, DE 19899-1031 (302) 571-8867 (telephone) (302) 351-8735 (facsimile)

Counsel for Munich Reinsurance America Inc., formerly known as American Re-Insurance Company

### <u>/s/ Ron H. Burnovski</u>

Ron H. Burnovski Texas Bar No. 24109409 CLAUSEN MILLER P.C. 325 N. Saint Paul Street Suite 3100 | Dallas, Texas 75201 469.942.8633

Counsel for Old Republic Insurance Company

/s/ Richard A. Galbo Richard A. Galbo (pro hac vice) New York Bar No.: 1970888 GOLDBERG SEGALLA LLP 665 Main Street Buffalo, NY 14203 Telephone: 716.710.5810 rgalbo@goldbergsegalla.com

Ashlyn Capote (pro hac vice) New York Bar No. 5200969 Michigan Bar No. P76342 665 Main Street Buffalo, NY 14203 Telephone: 716.510.5899 acapote@goldbergsegalla.com

Alissa K. Christopher Texas Bar No. 11531020 COZEN O'CONNOR 1717 Main Street **Suite 3100** Dallas, TX 75201 Telephone: 214.462.3299 akchristopher@cozen.com

Counsel for National Casualty Company, Nationwide Affinity Insurance Company of America, Nationwide Mutual Insurance Company, Scottsdale Insurance Company and Wausau General Insurance Company

#### /s/ J. Richard Harmon

J. Richard Harmon Texas Bar No. 09020700 Jo Allison Stasney Texas Bar No. 19080280 John M. Wiggins Texas Bar No. 24115950 THOMPSON, COE, COUSINS & IRONS, L.L.P. Plaza of the Americas 700 N. Pearl Street, Twenty-Fifth Floor Dallas, Texas 75201-2832 Telephone: 214-871-8200 Telecopy: 214-871-8209

rharmon@thompsoncoe.com jstasney@thompsoncoe.com jwiggins@thompsoncoe.com

Counsel for QBE Insurance Corporation

/s/ Joseph A Ziemianski
Joseph A Ziemianski
Texas Bar No. 00797732
COZEN O'CONNOR
1221 McKinney
Suite 2900
Houston, TX 77010

Telephone: (832) 214-3900 Facsimile: (832) 214-3905 jziemianski@cozen.com

Alicia G. Curran
Texas Bar No. 12587500
COZEN O'CONNOR
1717 Main Street, Suite 3100
Dallas, Texas 75201-7335
Telephone: (214) 462-3000
Telecopier: (214) 462-3299
acurran@cozen.com

Kristie M. Abel (pro hac vice)
PA Bar No. 311481
COZEN O'CONNOR
One Liberty Place
1650 Market Street
Philadelphia, PA 19103
Tel: 215-665-2715
kabel@cozen.com

Counsel for Endurance American Insurance Company and Endurance American Specialty Insurance Company

/s/ Shannon M. O'Malley
Shannon M. O'Malley
Texas Bar No. 24037200
somalley@zellelaw.com
Kerry K. Brown
Texas Bar No. 03149880
kbrown@zellelaw.com

/s/ Lance V. Clack
Lance V. Clack
Texas State Bar No. 24040694
lance.clack@figdav.com
FIGARI + DAVENPORT, LLP
901 Main Street, Suite 3400
Dallas, TX 75202
(214) 939-2000
(214) 939-2090 (Fax)

Laura S. McKay (pro hac vice to be filed)
llinois State Bar No. 6207837
lmckay@hww-law.com
Douglas M. DeWitt (pro hac vice to be filed)
Illinois State Bar No. 6274805
ddewitt@hww-law.com
HINKHOUSE WILLIAMS WALSH LLP
180 N. Stetson Avenue, Suite 3400
Chicago, IL 60601
(312) 784-5415
(312) 784-5499 (fax)

Counsel for Sparta Insurance Company, as successor for certain limited purposes to American Employers' Insurance Company

/s/ W. Edward Carlton
W. Edward Carlton
Texas Bar No. 03820050
ecarlton@qslwm.com
Quilling, Selander, Lownds, Winslet & Moser,
P.C.
2001 Bryan Street, Suite 1800

Megan E. Zeller Texas Bar No. 24082187 mzeller@zellelaw.com ZELLE LLP

901 Main Street, Suite 4000

Dallas, TX 75202

Telephone: 214-742-3000 Facsimile: 214-760-8994

Counsel for Swiss Re. Corporate
Solutions Capacity Insurance Corporation
(formerly known as, or otherwise
responsible for the liability of, First
Specialty Insurance Corporation) and
Westport Insurance Corporation

Dallas, Texas 75201

Telephone: (214) 781-2100 Facsimile: (214) 871-2111

Catalina J. Sugayan (pro hac vice)

Illinois Bar No. 6191764

Bradley E. Puklin (pro hac vice)

Illinois Bar No. 6309950 Clyde & Co US LLP

55 West Monroe Street, Suite 3000

Chicago, IL 60603

Telephone: (312) 635-7000 Facsimile: (312) 635-6950

Email: catalina.sugayan@clydeco.us Email: Bradley.puklin@clyde.co.us

Counsel for Tenecom Limited (formerly known as Winterthur Swiss Insurance Company) and Catalina Worthing Insurance Ltd (CWIL) (formerly known as Hartford Financial Products International as Part VII Transferee of Excess Insurance Co Ltd and London & Edinburgh Insurance Co Ltd, as successor to London & Edinburgh General Insurance Co Ltd.)

#### /s/ Steven T. Ramos

Steven T. Ramos
Texas Bar No. 00784812
AYIK & ASSOCIATES
1301 E. Collins Blvd., Suite 290
Richardson, Texas 75081
Phone: (214) 570, 6506

Phone: (214) 570-6596 Facsimile: (214) 570-6262 Email: stramos@travelers.com

Kathleen D. Monnes (*pro hac vice* application forthcoming)
Connecticut Bar No. 407246
DAY PITNEY LLP
225 Asylum Street
Hartford, CT 06103

Phone: (860) 275-0103 Facsimile: (860) 881-2482

Email: kdmonnes@daypitney.com

Candace J. Hensley (*pro hac vice*) Massachusetts Bar No. 706150 DAY PITNEY LLP One Federal Street Boston, MA 02110 Phone: (617) 345-4676

Facsimile: (617) 716-2136

Email: chensley@daypitney.com

Counsel for Charter Oak Fire Insurance Company; Phoenix Insurance Company; St. Paul Fire and Marine Insurance Company; St. Paul Mercury Insurance Company; St. Paul Surplus Lines Insurance Company; The Travelers

Companies, Inc.; The Travelers Indemnity Company; Travelers Casualty and Surety Company; and United States Fidelity and

Guaranty Company

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I certify that a true and correct copy of the foregoing has been served on all counsel of record by electronic service on October 6, 2023:

/s/ Betty X. Yang